

OFFICE OF THE CITY CONTROLLER



**FINANCE DEPARTMENT
VEHICLE ALLOWANCE PROGRAM AUDIT**

Annise D. Parker, City Controller

Steve Schoonover, City Auditor



OFFICE OF THE CITY CONTROLLER
CITY OF HOUSTON
TEXAS

ANNISE D. PARKER

January 8, 2009

The Honorable Bill White, Mayor
City of Houston, Texas

SUBJECT: Finance Department
Vehicle Allowance Program Audit (Report No. 2009-23)

Dear Mayor White:

The City Controller's Office Audit Division has completed an audit of the Vehicle Allowance Program within the Finance Department (Department). The audit objective was to determine whether the allowances were administered in compliance with Administrative Procedure 2-2 (Motor Vehicle Assignment and Use), Executive Order No. 1-41 (Executive Vehicle Assignment/Allowance), and Department Standard Operating Procedures.

The report, attached for your review, concluded that the Department was generally in compliance with AP 2-2 and EO 1-41, except for the findings presented in the body of the report. The Views of Responsible Officials as to actions being taken are appended to the report as Exhibit I.

We commend Department management for their timely efforts to take action to remedy the deficiencies identified by the audit team. We also appreciate the cooperation extended to our auditors by Department personnel during the course of the audit.

Respectfully submitted,

Annise D. Parker
City Controller

xc: City Council Members
Anthony Hall, Chief Administrative Officer
Michael Moore, Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office
Michelle Mitchell, Director, Finance Department
Alfred J. Moran, Jr., Director, Administration and Regulatory Affairs Department

CONTENTS

LETTER OF TRANSMITTAL	i
PURPOSE AND SCOPE	2
AUDIT PROCEDURES	2
CONCLUSION	2
INTRODUCTION	3

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

I COMPLIANCE WITH MOTOR VEHICLE RECORD REQUIREMENTS	3
II COMPLIANCE WITH DEFENSIVE DRIVING COURSE REQUIREMENTS.....	3
VIEWS OF RESPONSIBLE OFFICIALS.....	EXHIBIT I

PURPOSE AND SCOPE

The Office of the City Controller has completed an audit of the Vehicle Allowance Program (Program) within the Finance Department (Department). Our objective was to determine whether the Program was operating in compliance with Administrative Procedure 2-2, Motor Vehicle Assignment and Use (AP 2-2), Executive Order No. 1-41, Executive Vehicle Assignment/Allowance (EO 1-41), and Department Standard Operating Procedures.

The audit scope included Department employees currently receiving a vehicle allowance. The work did not constitute an evaluation of the overall internal control structure within the Department. The audit procedures were designed to: assess the level of compliance with procedures; determine adequacy of internal controls related to the Program; and provide recommendations for improvement where appropriate.

Department management is responsible for establishing and maintaining a system of internal controls to adequately account for vehicle allowances as an integral part of the Department's overall internal control structure. The objectives of the system are to provide management with reasonable, but not absolute, assurance that administration of vehicle allowances complies with all applicable procedures, orders, and laws.

Due to the inherent limitations found in any system of internal controls, errors or irregularities may occur and may not be detected. Also, projection of any evaluation of the system to future periods is subject to the risk that procedures may become inadequate due to changes in conditions, or that the degree of compliance with procedures may deteriorate.


AUDIT PROCEDURES

Audit procedures included development of an attribute checklist used to test compliance with AP 2-2 and EO 1-41, such as:


- Completion, proper approval, and maintenance of required forms
- Determination of driver qualifications
- Correctness of approved allowance rates
- Semi-annual reviews of mileage logs to adjust allowance rates when necessary
- Implementation of disciplinary action for non-compliance with AP 2-2 and EO 1-41

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of our audit, we concluded that the Department was generally in compliance with AP 2-2 and EO 1-41, except for the findings presented in the body of the report.


Scott Haiflich, CGAP
Auditor-in-charge


Arnie Adams, CFE, CIA
Audit Manager


Steve Schoonover, CFE
City Auditor

INTRODUCTION

According to a report generated from the payroll system and provided by the Administration and Regulatory Affairs Department, as of February 22, 2008, the Department had two Executive employees receiving vehicle allowances.

EO 1-41 establishes a policy of vehicle assignment or allowance for City Executive staff who use a vehicle or incur transportation expenses while engaged in the performance of City business. This EO also requires that vehicle allowances for Department Directors and Deputy Directors be approved by the Office of the Mayor.

AP 2-2 provides uniform operating rules and procedures to help ensure driver and passenger safety, protection of the public, disciplinary equity, and efficient use and maintenance of vehicles.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

I COMPLIANCE WITH MOTOR VEHICLE RECORD REQUIREMENTS

BACKGROUND

AP 2-2, Section 8.3, requires that City Departments, at least annually, obtain and review the motor vehicle record (MVR) of each employee who drives on City business to determine if the employee is qualified to drive on City business in accordance with the policy.

FINDING

Discussion with Department management revealed that MVRs have not been obtained annually. The Department requested MVRs from the Texas Department of Public Safety in preparation for the audit.

RECOMMENDATION

Annual MVRs should be ordered from the Texas Department of Public Safety for all Department employees who drive on City business. When received, the MVRs should be reviewed and, if necessary, appropriate action taken. The MVRs should be filed in employee files to support compliance with AP 2-2.

II COMPLIANCE WITH DEFENSIVE DRIVING COURSE REQUIREMENTS

BACKGROUND

AP 2-2, Section 14.2, requires that any employee who drives on City business complete a defensive driving course (DDC) prior to driving on City business and that the DDC be repeated every 36 months.

FINDING

Audit testing revealed that both of the Department employees receiving vehicle allowances had not completed a DDC as required by AP 2-2. However, both employees completed a DDC prior to the issuance of this report.

RECOMMENDATION

Upon completion of the DDC, the Department should attach the certificate of completion to Form D, Request for Vehicle Allowance, and submit the documentation to Central Payroll. In the future, management should require that the DDC be completed and the related certificate submitted with the original Form D, prior to driving on City business, and that the course be repeated every 36 months.

EXHIBIT I



CITY OF HOUSTON
Finance Department

Interoffice
Correspondence

To: Annise Parker, Controller

From: Michelle Mitchell, Director
Finance

Date: December 10, 2008

Subject: **Finance Dept-Vehicle Allowance Program**

We have reviewed the Audit Report and recommendations. It is the policy of the Finance Department to comply with all rules and regulations of the City and, therefore, any findings that determine we are not in compliance, such as the filing on a timely basis of the MVRs, will be addressed and will have no future impact.

Please let me know if you have any questions.


Michelle Mitchell, Director

**Views of Responsible
Officials**

2008 DEC 12 AM 11:52
CONTROLLER'S